

CITY OF SANTA CLARA



HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING

January 3, 2008 - Thursday
City Manager's Staff Conference Room
1500 Warburton Avenue, Santa Clara

MINUTES

7:00 P.M.

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

A. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1159 Madison Street (PLN2007-06740).

B. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1464 Franklin Street (PLN2007-06766).

C. Request for Historic Designation and Mills Act Contract - 1232 Warburton Avenue (PLN2007-06708).

I. Call to Order

Chairperson McKee called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

II. Roll Call

Commissioners: Marinshaw, McKee, Petersen, Richards and Wilson.

Commissioners Boynton and Patton were excused.

Staff Present: – Development Review Officer Gloria Sciara, AICP and Preservation and Architectural Advisor Craig Mineweaser, AIA

Guests Present: Don Arnoldy, Joe Sugg, Fawzy Ismail, Roger Cummings and Juvenal Silveira.

III. Requests for withdrawals and continuances without a hearing

None

IV. Approval of Minutes

A. HLC Meeting Minutes of November 1, 2007

It was moved by Commissioner Wilson, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and carried to approve the minutes of November 1, 2007; subject to the notation that Commissioner Wilson was present (but not noted under Roll Call).

- V. Items on this Agenda Requiring Council Action
The following items may be heard by the City Council upon a recommendation by the Historical and Landmarks Commission:
Agenda Item IX.A. 1159 Madison Street
Agenda Item IX.B. 1464 Franklin Street
Agenda Item IX.C. 1232 Warburton Avenue
- VI. Council and Planning Commission Actions Pertaining to the
Ms. Sciara reported on City Council and Planning Commission items of interest to the Historical and Landmarks Commission.
- VII. Correspondence/Announcements
A. General Correspondence Distributed in Commission Packet
- Copy of email regarding opposition to the 49er Stadium Proposal- addressed to HLC and other Boards and Commissions
 - Copy of Certified Local Government Annual Report
- VIII. Public Presentations
There were no public presentations.
- IX. New Business
A. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1159 Madison Street (PLN2007-06740).
Ms. Sciara reviewed the request for a Mills Act while noting the property was currently designated as an Architecturally/Significant Property.

Commissioner Marinshaw stated she did not support the accessory unit being included in the as part of the Mills Act contract and receiving tax relief. Commission discussion followed regarding the 10-year plan proposed. Commissioner Richards noted that railing on the porch was not in keeping with the architectural style of the structure and should be changed and the front door. Commissioner Marinshaw requested that the carport listed on the plan be removed and replaced with a more appropriate restoration project. Staff was then requested to follow-up with the property owner to conduct a site visit to determine additional preservation related projects and to amend the 10 year plan as appropriate prior to the contract being forwarded to the City Council.

It was then moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and carried (Commissioner opposed, Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to recommend City Council approval of a Mills Act Contract for this property located at 1159 Madison Street, subject to the revised 10-year plan as determined by staff and including an historically accurate front door and porch railing.

B. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1464 Franklin Street (PLN2007-06766).
Ms. Sciara reviewed the request while noting the structure was currently designated as historically significant and was the former residence of the Eberhard Family. She noted the current property owner was presently restoring the Period Revival/Craftsman styled residence and Ms. Sciara then stated that the property owner had done an exemplary job using period tile, restoration of the mouldings and restoring period features. Mr. Mineweaser concurred with the work and asked about the small addition. Mr. Juvenal

Silveira detailed the restoration and preservation work on the exterior and interior of the property. In response to a question from Commissioner Richards, Mr. Silveira indicated that a garage and accessory unit was approved in the back of the property but that this work would be done in the future.

It was then moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Wilson and carried (Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to recommend City Council approval of a Mills Act Contract for this property located at 1464 Franklin Street.

C. Request for Historic Designation and Mills Act Contract – 1232 Warburton Avenue (PLN2007-06708).

Ms. Sciara reviewed the request for historic designation and Mills Act contract for the property located at 1232 Warburton Avenue. She noted the new property owner had contracted an outside consultant to perform the necessary historic report and that the historic research found the property retains sufficient integrity to qualify as a historic property and eligible for listing on the City's Significant Properties list. Ms. Sciara then stated that the property owner had done an exemplary job using period tile, restoration of the mouldings and restoring period features. She then noted that staff was supportive of the request.

Mr. Mineweaser noted that the restoration work was appropriate for the period, also the architecture and work was well done. Mr. Cummings, property owner indicated that he and his wife purchased the home in December 2004 and it was in substantial disrepair. Efforts undertaken to date include restoration and repair to the historical wood siding, wooden gutters, mouldings, as well as new plumbing, electrical upgrades, and the installation of a period kitchen and use of historical stained glass windows.

It was then moved by Commissioner Wilson, seconded by Commissioner Marinshaw and carried (Commissioner Richards opposed, Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to recommend approval of a Mills Act Contract for the property located at 1232 Warburton Avenue to the City Council

It was then moved by Commissioner Wilson, seconded by Commissioner Marinshaw and carried (Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to recommend City Council add the property to the City's Historically/Architecturally Significant Properties List for the property located at 1232 Warburton Avenue.

D. Request for Demolition and Architectural Review of a New Single Residence and Accessory Structures – 4190 Bassett Street (PLN2007-06778).

Ms. Sciara briefly reviewed the request for the demolition of the existing historic residence and for the construction of a new single-family dwelling. She then noted staff was recommending a continuance of this item to February 7, 2008 to receive comments and recommendation from the Honorary City Historian; and to update the evaluation to include Local Significance Criteria. Ms. Sciara also noted that the structure was listed on the City's significant properties list.

Commissioner Richards stated that he had concerns with the outside services that prepare historic resource surveys and feels the conclusions of the reports directly

reflect the application requests and therefore are not unbiased. He further noted that the block on which this structure sits the house itself is significant and should not be demolished. He also noted that the context of the house on a historically significant block also contributes to its significance.

Advisor Mineweaser stated that there is a effect on historic integrity of the neighborhood when the historic fabric and individual buildings of merit or significance are lost as they collectively support one another as historic contexts are lost.

Commissioner Peterson stated he did not support demolition. The remaining Commissioners agreed with the previous comments.

It was then moved by Commissioner Petersen, seconded by Commissioner Richards and unanimously carried to deny the request for demolition and that based on the architectural style, substantial level of historic fabric remaining on the buildings and the context of the block of other historic houses that the structure at 4190 Bassett is historically significant.

E. Request for Variance for a New Front Porch Addition – 1593 Lexington Street (APN 2007-06722).

Ms. Sciara reviewed the request for variance in order to reduce the front yard setback requirement in conjunction with a front porch addition. She noted Correction Notices had been issued and staff was not supporting the request because the lot is larger than normal, nearly 12,000 square feet in area, and the front setbacks of the other homes on the block were all greater than the setback proposed. She also noted it appeared that the original porch was enclosed and that the masonry on the porch appeared to be sandstone, and was a feature added after the house was originally built.

Advisor Mineweaser stated that the masonry application was now historic with sandstone being very rare and delicate/porous and should be preserved. He that is features is unusual and that it has gained importance over time. He further noted the collective importance of the entire block of homes

Commissioner Richards stated that he had concerns with the removal of the original wood windows and that they should have been preserved and the “lights” or windowpane pattern was not the same as the original.

The property owner then addressed the Commission. Mr. Ismail stated he has been working with city staff on the window replacement. He provided a survey showing the shallower setback in the vicinity of the neighborhood. He also noted that the porch is now part of the living area and could not be restored. In response to a question, Mr. Ismail stated he could preserve the sandstone even if the porch was expanded. He also noted that he needs the porch expansion to enhance the architecture and as shelter from the elements. In response to a question, Mr. Ismail stated that to return the porch to its original condition would result in an extreme hardship.

Commissioner Richards stated that Mr. Ismail cited locations other than the immediate area, and that setbacks need to be in context with the rest of the block the house is located on to warrant a change.

It was moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and carried (Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to recommend that the Planning Commission deny the variance for a reduction in front yard building setback and that the Historical and Landmarks Commission also recommends denial of the project design. The Commission then noted that the sandstone cladding on the front elevation must be preserved as part of any elevation changes.

F. Request for Demolition of the Reserve Officers' Training Corps Building on the Santa Clara University campus

Ms. Sciara reviewed the staff report for the demolition of the former ROTC building located on the Santa Clara University Campus. She noted a report was prepared by Albion Environmental, Inc. which concluded the building does not meet significant criteria adopted by City Council and that it does not qualify as a historically or architecturally significant resource.

The Commission then discussed the mitigation measure recommended from the City's Honorary Historian, Lorie Garcia for the University to prepare a Historic American Building Survey (HABS).

Joe Sugg, University Representative discussed the requested demolition and future plans for the university improvements.

A five-minute recess was called at 8:20 pm.

Supplemental photographs prepared by Lorie Garcia were then shown following the recess that documented other campus ROTC buildings. These photographs were reviewed by the Commission to consider whether a HABS report was worthwhile or necessary. Mr. Sugg indicated that the University would complete this study if the Commission found it warranted

After due consideration, the Commission requested that the University prepare documentation similar to or consistent with the HABS standards for historic buildings.

It was moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Wilson and unanimously carried (Commissioners Boynton and Patton excused) to accept staff's findings that the project is a ministerial action subject to issuance of a demolition permit subject to the line drawings and photographs consistent with HABS standards being submitted to the City documenting the buildings so recommend that the Historical and Landmarks Commission concur with staff.

Mr. Sugg then invited the Commissioners to tour a relocated craftsman bungalow structure on Benton Street owned by the University.

- X. Old Business, Referrals and Continued Items
 - A. Mills Act Criteria – Exterior and Interior Changes, Additions, Inspections and Other changes.

No discussion took place. The Commission requested this item be placed on the agenda for discussion by the full Commission for the February meeting.

- XI. Commissioner/Committee Reports
 - A. Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee)
[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headen-Inman House]
There was no report

- B. Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Marinshaw)
[Second Friday of each month at 10:00 a.m.- Harris Lass Preserve]
Commissioner Marinshaw reported that the Historic Home Tour had been very successful and over 900 tickets were sold.

- C. Old Quad Residents Association (Richards/McKee alternate)
There was no report.

- D. Neighborhood University Relations (Petersen)
There was no report.

- E. Architectural Committee (Marinshaw/Patton)
There was no report.

- F. Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Wilson and Patton)
Commissioner Wilson reported that the museum is near completion and ready to open. It was then noted this committee can sunset as the museum was complete.

- G. BART Committee (Marinshaw)
Commissioner Marinshaw noted there had not been a meeting.

- XII. Items Considered, Time Permitting

The CLG Annual Report contained in the HLC packet was mentioned. Per Commissioner Marinshaw's request the item will receive discussion at the February meeting.

- XIII. A. Commission Budget for 2007-08
No Report

- XIV. Pending Agenda Items (notice of upcoming agenda items only- No discussion)
 - A. Commissioner Training
 - B. Further updates on Harris-Lass Preserve

XV. Adjournment

As there was no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted and approved by:

Gloria Sciara, AICP
Development Review Officer